

Immigrants and Employment: A Comparison of Montreal and Toronto between 1981 and 1996*

Valerie Preston
Department of Geography
York University
North York, ON M3J 1P3

Joseph C. Cox
Economics Department
Ryerson Polytechnic University
Toronto, ON M5B 2K3

Immigrants continue to have higher unemployment rates and lower wages than Canadian-born workers even after controlling for variations in educational attainments (Badets and Howatson-Lee 1998; Reitz 1998). Recent efforts to explain immigrants' economic difficulties have examined their skills and educational attainments and access to social institutions; however, these analyses have addressed the national situation (Boyd 1992; Reitz 1998; DeVoretz 1995). Researchers have often overlooked the diverse economic opportunities and constraints that immigrants encounter when they settle in Canada's largest cities (Badets and Howatson-Lee 1998; Pendakur and Pendakur 1998). To illustrate the importance of intermetropolitan diversity, this study examines the labour market segmentation of immigrant workers in the Toronto and Montreal Census Metropolitan Areas.¹

We are grateful to Walter Geisbrecht who gave us access to the Census data. The research was completed with funding from the Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement -- Toronto. All correspondence should be addressed to the first author.

1. The Census Metropolitan Area, identified hereafter as the CMA, is the area surrounding a city of more than 50,000 people that is socially and economically linked to it. Practically, the CMA includes most of the labour shed within which commuters travel daily to work.

Specifically, the sectoral distributions of immigrant and Canadian-born workers of both sexes in 1981, 1991 and 1996 are compared. The extent to which workers are concentrated in specific industrial sectors are evaluated to determine which birthplace groups have experienced improving economic circumstances and which have suffered economic decline. Although the analysis is descriptive, we speculate on the reasons that some immigrant groups have been more successful than others in each metropolitan area.

The study adds to our understanding of the economic performance of immigrants and their impacts upon the Canadian economy in three ways. By extending the empirical analysis to 1996, we update previous studies that concentrated on trends between 1981 and 1991 (Chui and Devereaux 1995; Preston and Giles 1997; Mata 1996). Substantial changes in economic circumstances and Canadian immigration policy since 1991 have affected immigrants' economic integration. The most severe recession since the Great Depression has had a major impact on the economies of both metropolitan areas. The decision to maintain high immigration levels has meant that a large number of recent immigrants have arrived during a period of serious economic difficulties.

Montreal and Toronto are compared because of their historic importance as the main ports of entry for immigrants to Canada. Each has been a destination for the main waves of immigrants in the twentieth century. The comparison indicates how local circumstances mediate the effects of national and international economic and social changes. In both metropolitan areas, the North American Free Trade Agreement and federal policies to reduce the fiscal deficit altered the course of economic restructuring. However, the economic and political history of each metropolitan area influenced the magnitude and direction of changes in specific industries with its concomitant impacts on labour demand.

Labour supply in each metropolitan area is also distinct. The main sources of recent immigrants and the social geography of immigrant settlement differ between the two metropolitan areas. In Montreal, the spatial separation of anglophone and francophone populations has accentuated the segregation of recent immigrants from Haiti, Lebanon and France who are concentrated in the city centre. In Toronto, large groups of immigrants from Asian countries are dispersed throughout an inner ring of postwar suburbs and increasingly, in the outer ring of newly developed suburbs (Ray 1998).

Finally, by taking account simultaneously of the effects of gender and birthplace on industry of employment, the empirical analysis reveals the interplay between these two important dimensions of social differentiation in the labour market. Women are segregated within the Canadian labour market where their average wages and salaries are lower than those of men, even in female-dominated occupations (Statistics Canada 1995). Immigrant women must also contend with their status as immigrants. Employers' demands for Canadian experience, professional associations' unwillingness to recognise foreign credentials, lack of training and skills, limited proficiency in Canada's official languages, and discrimination on the basis of race, ethnicity, and accent pose challenges for all immigrant workers. Historically, immigrants have successfully overcome these hurdles. Over time,

immigrant earnings have approached those of Canadian-born workers with equivalent qualifications and experience. Recent evidence from the 1991 census (Lian and Matthews 1998; Reitz 1998; Statistics Canada 1998) indicates that earnings inequality is persisting among recent arrivals, particularly those who are members of visible minorities. Immigrant women who must overcome the dual challenges of being an immigrant and a female worker are likely to be among the workers most affected by persistent inequality.

The paper is organised into five sections, beginning with a brief description of immigrant populations in each city. The economic histories of the two cities and the availability of data are reviewed to set the context for the subsequent description of labour market segmentation in 1996. The fourth section reviews the trends that led to current gender and birthplace segmentation. The main findings and their implications are summarised in concluding remarks.

Immigrants in Toronto and Montreal

Toronto is home to the largest concentration of immigrants in Canada, whereas the share of immigrants in Montreal's population approaches the national average of 17.6%. Since 1981, the total number of immigrants living in each metropolitan area has increased steadily, but the rate of increase has been faster in Toronto than in Montreal. By 1996, immigrants accounted for 42% of the Toronto Census Metropolitan Area population and 18% of the Montreal Census Metropolitan Area population. As a result, immigrants who arrived in the preceding five years accounted for a slightly larger share of all immigrants living in Toronto than in Montreal, approximately 23% versus approximately 21% (Table 1).

Differences in selection criteria affect the main sources of recent immigrants in each metropolitan area.² Although recent immigrants from Asia and the Caribbean outnumber those from European birthplaces in both metropolitan areas, francophone countries: Haiti, Lebanon, and France, are the main sources of immigrants who arrived between 1991 and 1996 in Montreal. During the same period, the top three birthplaces of immigrants settling in Toronto were Hong Kong, Sri Lanka, and the People's Republic of China that together accounted for more than a quarter of all immigrants. Despite the growing numbers of immigrants from Asia, European immigrants still dominate in both metropolitan areas. In Toronto, 158,070 immigrants from the United Kingdom slightly outnumber

	Montreal CMA		Toronto CMA	
	Female (%)	Male (%)	Female (%)	Male (%)
Education				

2. Available information describes the country of birth of each immigrant which is not always the country from which the immigrant moved to Canada.

less than highschool	24.3	18.1	17.7	13.1
some highschool	11.7	11.1	16.7	17.1
highschool graduate	15.7	14.8	15.8	14.6
some post-secondary	8.0	8.1	8.8	8.4
post-secondary graduate	33.7	40.2	34.8	39.4
Knowledge of Official Language				
English only	23.0	21.9	83.7	87.6
French only	27.2	22.3	0.1	0.1
both	40.3	50.6	5.3	5.3
neither	9.4	5.2	10.8	7.0
Period of Arrival				
prior to 1965	22.0	22.3	19.2	19.4
1966 - 1985	36.8	35.2	37.2	37.2
1986 - 1990	13.9	13.9	16.2	16.9
1991 - 1996	21.4	21.0	23.9	23.1
Total Immigrant Workers (000)	264	200	707	816
Per Cent of Total Workers	8.3	11.0	21.6	24.9

Source: Computed by authors.

146,515 born in Italy, while in Montreal, the 72,325 residents born in Italy greatly outnumber the second largest group of 43,075 Haitians (Statistics Canada 1997).

Country of origin has important implications for the economic experiences of immigrants. Many aspects of human capital, the skills, educational attainments, language proficiency, and work experience that affect immigrants' abilities to compete for jobs as well as earnings (Borjas 1993), are influenced by birthplace. The diverse origins of immigrants settling in Toronto and Montreal have contributed to slight differences in their human capital. In Montreal, immigrants are slightly less well educated than in Toronto (Table 1). Almost a quarter of female immigrants and approximately 18% of male immigrants in the Montreal metropolitan area are poorly educated with less than a high school education. Of the immigrants living in the Toronto metropolitan area, only 17.7% of women and 13.1% of men have less than a high school education. Apart from this slight difference, the educational attainments of immigrants are similar in both urban regions, with slightly more than a third of women and approximately 40% of male immigrants having a post-secondary certificate or degree (Table 1).

Immigrants' knowledge of official languages, another crucial predictor of economic success (Boyd 1992; Chiswick 1992), also varies between Montreal and Toronto. In Montreal, the largest group of immigrants is bilingual, claiming knowledge of French and English. Another 22% of immigrant men and 27% of immigrant women know only French, with approximately equal shares knowing only English (Table 1). Government policies that have promoted French-language schooling for immigrant children combined with selection criteria that favour francophone immigrants have been successful in encouraging immigrants to develop and maintain knowledge of French (St. Germain 1997). The high rates of

bilingualism among Montreal's immigrants may also be a response to a local labour market in which bilingual workers earn wage premiums (Pendakur and Pendakur 1998). In Toronto, knowledge of Canada's official languages is confined mostly to English, with more than 80% of immigrant women and men reporting that they only know English. Slightly higher proportions of immigrants in Toronto than in Montreal also know neither official language. These immigrants are penalised in both metropolitan economies where men and women who speak neither official language earn between 10% and 18% less than immigrants fluent in one of the official languages (Pendakur and Pendakur 1998).³

Human capital is only one of the factors that contributes to differences in the economic success of immigrants from various countries of origin. Even after differences in human capital are considered, immigrants from the United States, United Kingdom and other western and northern European countries are more successful economically than other immigrants (Ornstein 1996; Reitz 1998; Lian and Matthew 1998). The same trends are apparent for immigrant women, who often find that gender discrimination in the educational systems and labour markets in their countries of origin compounds the difficulties of finding remunerative, suitable employment (Boyd 1992; Preston and Giles 1997). According to labour market segmentation theory, immigrants' diverse economic experiences are an inherent aspect of contemporary labour markets (Peck 1996). In a labour market that is divided into segments, ascribed characteristics, particularly, gender, skin colour and birthplace affect employment experiences as much as the achieved characteristics considered to be aspects of human capital. Employers' demands for Canadian experience, their unwillingness to recognise foreign experience, accreditation difficulties, and discrimination on the basis of accent and skin colour often consign immigrants from Asia, Africa, and Central and South America to poorly paid and insecure jobs in the secondary labour market. Public policies regarding education and welfare may mitigate the adverse influence of labour market segmentation, but in Canada, the influence of public policies is declining, raising the possibility of further deterioration in the economic circumstances of immigrants (Reitz 1998).

The size and migration history of each immigrant group influences economic integration (Waldinger 1997). Some immigrant groups have created successful ethnic economies which provide employment at the same time as they serve the needs of immigrants themselves. Despite immigrants' inherent advantages in competing for jobs in an ethnic economy where they speak the language of many consumers and they are familiar with consumer preferences, many jobs are insecure and poorly paid (Ma 1997; Preston and Man 1999; Liu 1996). Of course, employment in an ethnic economy is an option available only to immigrants who are part of a fairly large community that has acquired the resources necessary to

3. The wage differential is calculated after controlling for the effects of place of birth, foreign education, foreign work experience, and visible minority status (Pendakur and Pendakur 1998).

establish small businesses (Liu 1996).

Economic Circumstances

Any consideration of the effects of labour market structure and immigration history on the diverse economic experiences of immigrants necessarily draws attention to the economic and social circumstances in each metropolitan area where immigrants settle. In Toronto and Montreal, employment opportunities have changed significantly over the past twenty-five years (Coffey 1994). Manufacturing employment declined substantially in both places between 1971 and 1991; however, growth in service jobs more than compensated for the loss of manufacturing jobs, so total employment in each metropolitan area increased between 1971 and 1991. Nevertheless, the distributions of jobs among economic sectors in the two metropolitan economies diverged. With its large financial, insurance, and real estate services and business services sectors, Toronto's job growth outpaced that of Montreal. Total employment in Toronto increased by 76.4% between 1971 and 1991 compared with only 30.6% for Montreal during the same period (Coffey 1994). In Montreal, the relative weakness of financial services was compounded by loss of its Canadian hinterland. As Montreal became more francophone, businesses concentrated on a smaller hinterland of clients and customers in Quebec and among the declining numbers of francophones outside Quebec (Coffey and Polese 1993). The difference in total employment between the two metropolitan areas increased substantially from approximately 164,900 more jobs in Toronto than in Montreal in 1971 to a difference of 469,400 jobs in favour of the Toronto metropolitan area by 1991 (Coffey 1994: 35). After a lingering recession in the first half of the 1990s, the difference in total employment had increased to more than 520,000 jobs in 1996 (Statistics Canada 1998).

The sectoral patterns of employment in the two metropolitan areas have diverged since 1971 when growth in finance, insurance and real estate services and business services in Toronto began to outpace that in Montreal (Coffey 1994). By 1996, the sectoral distribution of employment in the two metropolitan areas differed in two respects. The dynamic services; finance, insurance and real estate services and business services, contributed more jobs to the Toronto metropolitan economy than to the Montreal economy. Together, the two industries accounted for 19.1% of employment in the Toronto CMA in 1996, compared with only 14.0% of employment in the Montreal CMA. Montreal is more reliant on employment in public services, specifically, health and social services, education, and government administration, that were 21.8% of all jobs in 1996 compared with only 18.8% of employment in Toronto. Reliance on public services is unlikely to accelerate Montreal's job growth. Since the beginning of the decade, reductions in government spending have slowed employment growth in public services and in some cases, actually reduced it (Chorney 1997).

For immigrants, the changing distribution of jobs among economic sectors has

important implications for their employment patterns. Historically, manufacturing and construction along with consumer services such as retailing and the hotel industry have provided entry-level jobs for immigrants who were not proficient in English or French, lacked the skills required for better jobs and whose credentials and experience were not recognised by Canadian employers (Pendakur and Mata 1998; Reitz 1998). The decline of manufacturing has been accompanied by the rise of part-time, temporary employment in all industrial sectors (Morissette et al. 1995). Both trends reduce the availability of the types of jobs that many immigrants had used to enter the labour market.

The impacts of sectoral changes in employment are likely to differ depending on immigrants' gender and country of birth. Historically, immigrant women have found employment in different sectors than immigrant men. For example, among Italian immigrants, men often worked in construction while women found factory jobs usually assembling and making consumer products (Iacovetta 1992). Immigrants from different birthplaces have also entered the labour market through different industries (Preston and Giles 1997). The current practice of recruiting Filipina women to work in Canada as live-in nannies and live-in caregivers is an extreme example, but it is not unique (Bakan and Stasiulus 1997). Teixeira (1996) has documented the chain migration process by which early Portuguese immigrants were recruited as farm labourers to work in Southern Ontario.

Data and Research Methods

To explore the changing employment patterns of immigrant men and women in Toronto and Montreal, information from the Public Use Microdata Samples (1989, 1993, 1999) was analysed. The Microdata provide detailed information about a sample of individuals that describes the main indicators of human capital: sex, highest level of educational attainment, and knowledge of Canada's official languages, immigration history and work history.

The immigration history of each worker is described in terms of country of birth and period of arrival in Canada. For the comparative analysis, both variables were aggregated to create identical categories across the three censuses. At each census, the categories for country of birth are redefined to reflect changes in the sources of recent immigrants to Canada. For example, the 1996 microdata sample provides information about immigrants from the Phillipines, Hong Kong, China, Vietnam, and other Asian countries of origin. In earlier censuses, these countries are grouped together as Asia. Period of arrival information was also aggregated into four time periods as follows: prior to 1965, 1966-1985, 1986-1990, 1991-1996. The categories capture the 1967 changes in immigration policy that removed discrimination on the basis of race, nationality, colour, religion, and national origin at the same time as the points system was initiated. Previous studies have suggested that from 1966 until 1985, immigrants' average incomes increased steadily with years of residence in Canada (DeVoretz 1995; Reitz 1998). We

separate the last half of the 1980s from the first half of the 1990s to distinguish the boom years in the second half of the 1980s from the economic decline that occurred in the first half of the 1990s.⁴

Our examination of changes in immigrants' employment includes the terms of employment that are described by distinguishing self-employed workers from employees and part-time workers who work thirty hours or less per week from full-time workers. These terms of employment can be linked with annual earnings that are reported separately for each worker. To ensure comparability, industries of employment were aggregated into 13 categories that include three goods-producing industries -- primary, manufacturing, and construction industries, and ten service industries.⁵ The service industries were grouped according to the typology proposed by Stanback and Noyelle (1984) that distinguishes among service industries on the basis of the market for the service and whether the service is provided by public agencies or private firms. On this basis, two distributive services -- transportation, communications, and utilities industries and wholesale trade, two producer services -- finance, insurance, and real estate services (known as F.I.R.E.) and business services, three social services -- health, education, and government administration, and three consumer services -- retail trade, accommodation, beverage, and food services, and all other services, were defined.

Immigrants in the Toronto and Montreal Labour Markets

Immigrants are significant participants in the labour markets of both metropolitan areas, where their shares of total employment range from 8.3% for immigrant women in Montreal to 24.9% for immigrant men in Toronto. In Toronto, immigrant men and women are almost one quarter of the workforce, 24.9% and 21.6% of the employed labour force. The importance of immigrants in the Toronto labour force is highlighted by comparison with Montreal where immigrant men and immigrant women are only 11.0% and 8.3% of the total work

TABLE 2 Percentage Distribution of Employment by Sector, among Canadian and Foreign Born of both Genders, Montreal and Toronto CMAs, 1996

	Montreal				Toronto				D _a
	Canadian Born		Immigrant		Canadian Born		Immigrant		
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	
Primary	31.6	53.9	4.3	10.2	33.6	37.2	11.5	17.7	16.0
Manufacturing	22.7	47.5	12.1	17.6	13.8	37.4	21.6	37.2	29.1
Construction	11.9	74.8	1.3	11.9	7.5	41.4	4.9	46.1	57.8

4. Longitudinal analysis is the most appropriate means of examining changes in income, but these data are not available for large enough samples to permit comparison of men and women by industry.
5. Primary processing employment is aggregated with manufacturing employment because the numbers of primary processing jobs in Toronto and in Montreal are very small.

Transportation	26.1	60.7	3.0	10.3	19.1	40.0	11.7	29.2	27.7
Wholesale trade	28.6	52.9	7.0	11.5	20.9	36.4	16.2	26.4	24.2
Retail trade	41.9	41.8	6.5	9.9	29.0	27.4	21.3	22.3	27.3
FIRE	55.3	31.2	7.3	6.2	31.4	23.3	26.5	18.8	31.8
Bus. services	37.8	43.7	6.6	11.9	27.9	30.8	18.6	22.8	23.0
Government	39.4	51.4	3.5	5.7	29.2	35.0	18.4	17.4	26.6
Education	51.7	28.5	10.4	9.4	42.7	20.0	22.7	14.6	17.5
Health	62.2	20.2	13.0	4.6	41.4	10.4	38.3	9.9	35.6
Accom.	43.6	32.8	8.0	15.7	23.5	21.6	24.0	30.9	31.8
Other	42.4	37.3	11.0	9.4	28.4	26.3	25.9	19.4	25.0
TOTAL	38.2	42.5	8.3	9.4	25.9	37.4	21.6	24.9	--

Note: 1. D_i = Index of dissimilarity between the Montreal and Toronto distributions.
2. Rows sum to 100 per cent for each CMA.

Source: Computed by authors.

force.

Looking in detail at the composition of the workforce for major industries, longstanding gender differences are immediately apparent (Table 2). For Canadian-born and immigrant workers, the patterns of gender differences are consistent with those reported nationally (Statistics Canada 1998). In both metropolitan areas, Canadian-born women are concentrated in service industries, particularly, consumer services, health and education services, and finance, insurance, and real estate services. Canadian-born men are concentrated in construction and manufacturing, the goods-producing industries, and in the distributive services, transportation, utilities, communication, and wholesale trade in both metropolitan areas.

Similar gender differences are apparent among immigrant workers. In both metropolitan areas, a larger share of immigrant women than immigrant men are employed in health and education services, finance, insurance and real estate services, and the catchall, other services. For immigrant men, employment in manufacturing, construction, wholesale trade, and accommodation, food and beverage services is more important than for immigrant women. The main exception to this consistent pattern of gender differences concerns employment in accommodation, food and beverage services. Among the Canadian-born, women have a larger share of employment in this industry than men, whereas the relationship is reversed for immigrant workers (Table 2). The predominance of male immigrant workers may indicate that they are having difficulty finding suitable employment. Immigrant men settle for jobs in the accommodation, food, and beverages sector because entry costs are low, skill requirements are also minimal and other job opportunities are not available to them (Waldinger 1996).

The effects of being an immigrant are also apparent when we examine employment in government and business services. In Montreal, Canadian-born women and Canadian-born men have a higher share of jobs in government services than their shares of the total labour force and for Canadian-born men, the same is true for business service jobs. The same pattern is found in Toronto where

Canadian-born women also have a higher share of all employment in business services than their share of the total labour force. The dominance of Canadian-born workers in government services is similar to that reported for American-born workers in New York City. Immigrants were excluded from government services by citizenship requirements, employers' preferences for 'American' experience and qualifications, and the implementation of affirmative action programs that encouraged hiring of American-born African-Americans (Bailey and Waldinger 1991). Business service jobs include many professional occupations such as lawyers and accountants where immigrants' foreign credentials may not be recognised. These are also some of the most desirable positions in each metropolitan economy where immigrants may not be able to compete with Canadian-born workers.

Manufacturing continues to be an important source of jobs for immigrant workers. In Montreal, immigrant workers of both sexes are over-represented in manufacturing jobs compared with their shares of the total labour force. In Toronto, immigrant men are very reliant on manufacturing employment where they account for 37.2% of the workforce, a share that is much larger than their share of the total labour force, 24.9% (Table 2). Immigrant women's share of manufacturing employment in Toronto is identical to their share of the total labour force and the same is true for Canadian-born men. Continuing reliance on manufacturing jobs as a major source of employment when national manufacturing employment contracted more than 2.0% between 1991 and 1996 leaves immigrant workers in both cities vulnerable to layoffs and unemployment (Statistics Canada 1998).

There are minor differences in employment patterns between Toronto and Montreal, even after we take account of the greater share of immigrant workers in Toronto. Jobs in the construction and manufacturing sectors in Montreal are dominated by Canadian-born men, whereas in Toronto, immigrant men have the largest shares of jobs in these sectors (Table 2). Quebec's provincial regulations limit immigrant workers' access to construction jobs, but the greater reliance of Canadian-born men on manufacturing jobs in Montreal than in Toronto is curious. It may reflect differences in union participation and the fewer well paid jobs in other sectors, particularly, finance, insurance and real estate services and business services. In 1996, 14.0% of the Montreal labour force was working in these two producer services, where 19.1% of the Toronto labour force worked.

Indices of dissimilarity confirmed that among all the industries, employment patterns in the construction industry differed most between the two metropolitan areas.⁶ The coefficient of dissimilarity of 57.8% for construction was higher than for any other industry (Table 2). It indicates that more than half the workforce would have to be redistributed, mainly from Canadian-born men to immigrant men

6. The index of dissimilarity was calculated comparing the shares of employment of the four groups of workers; Canadian-born men, Canadian-born women, immigrant men, and immigrant women, in each industry between Montreal and Toronto.

in Montreal or vice versa in Toronto so that the proportions of workers in construction were equivalent to their proportions in the labour force. Four other industries stand out with high values for the index of dissimilarity. In Montreal, the predominance of Canadian-born women in health services, in finance, insurance and real estate services, and accommodation, beverage, and food services sets it apart from Toronto where Canadian-born men, immigrant men, and immigrant women each have a larger share of employment in these sectors. For the three industries, the indices of dissimilarity exceed 30.0%. In contrast, the shares of employment held by Canadian-born and immigrant workers of both sexes are almost identical for education services in the two metropolitan areas. The lowest value of the coefficient of dissimilarity, 17.5%, was calculated for this sector. In sum, immigrants' shares of employment in one third of the industries, four of the twelve, vary between the two metropolitan areas. The two metropolitan economies differ in their incorporation of immigrants, but metropolitan differences are confined to specific economic sectors -- the construction industry, health services, F.I.R.E., and the accommodation, beverage and food services sector.

Overall, gender differences in employment dominate with country of birth having a secondary influence on the sectoral distribution of various workers. Canadian-born women and immigrants are marginalised in both urban labour markets. Their shares of employment in service sectors that are notorious for poorly-paid insecure jobs are higher than their shares of total employment. At the same time, Canadian-born men's shares of jobs in the goods-producing and producer service sectors are greater than expected on the basis of their share of total employment. Regulation plays an important role in the division of labour as evidenced by differences between the two urban labour markets. Compared with immigrant men in Toronto, immigrant men in Montreal are much less likely to be employed in the construction industry. Government regulation of the industry in Quebec seems to favour the Canadian-born.

Labour Market Participation of Immigrants, 1996

To highlight differences in immigrants' employment patterns in Toronto and Montreal, we calculated the proportion of immigrant men's and women's total employment in each industry. The analysis demonstrates the relative importance of each industry to immigrants rather than the importance of immigrant workers

TABLE 3 Percentage Distribution' of Workers by Industry, Class of Worker, and Hours of Work for Canadian-Born and Immigrant Workers in Montreal and Toronto CMAs, 1996

Industry	Montreal				Toronto			
	Canadian-born		Immigrant		Canadian Born		Immigrant	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
Primary	0.7	1.1	0.5	0.8	0.9	1.0	0.4	0.5
Manufacturing	10.6	20.0	26.1	28.6	8.8	16.4	16.5	24.6
Construction	1.3	7.4	0.7	4.5	1.4	7.2	1.1	8.9
Trans/Comm/Util	5.3	11.2	2.8	7.4	5.2	10.2	3.8	8.2

Wholesale Trade	4.6	7.7	5.2	6.5	5.2	8.5	4.8	6.8
Retail Trade	13.9	12.5	9.9	11.4	13.4	11.9	11.8	10.7
FIRE	8.5	4.4	5.2	3.3	10.4	7.3	10.6	6.5
Business Svcs.	8.0	8.3	6.4	8.7	11.3	11.7	9.0	9.6
Government	5.1	6.0	2.1	2.6	4.5	5.1	3.4	2.8
Education	9.4	4.7	8.7	6.0	10.6	4.7	6.7	3.8
Hlth & Soc. Svcs.	16.1	4.7	15.5	4.2	13.4	3.1	14.8	3.3
Accom./Food/Bev.	7.2	4.9	6.1	9.0	5.7	4.9	9.6	7.7
Other services	9.1	7.2	10.9	7.0	9.2	8.1	10.1	6.6
Class of Worker								
Employed	94.1	87.3	92.0	83.8	91.7	85.8	91.8	83.4
Self-employed	5.9	12.7	8.0	16.2	8.3	14.2	8.2	16.6
Hours of Work per Week								
Part-time	26.2	11.9	21.6	11.6	26.9	13.5	20.9	10.0
Full-time	73.8	88.1	78.4	88.4	73.1	86.5	79.1	90.0
Wages and Salaries								
mean	12,173	21,621	8,132	16,167	16,920	26,933	11,777	20,577
Coeff. of Variation ²	1.35	1.20	1.74	1.50	1.22	1.20	1.44	1.30

Note: 1. For industries, class of workers, and hours of work, percentages sum to 100.
2. Calculated as the ratio of standard deviation to mean.

Source: Computed by authors.

within the metropolitan economy. Immigrants' reliance on manufacturing jobs is immediately apparent in Montreal where almost 30% of immigrant men and immigrant women are employed in manufacturing (Table 3). In contrast, only 16.5% of immigrant women and 24.6% of immigrant men in Toronto are employed in manufacturing. The importance of jobs in construction for immigrant men in Toronto is also underscored by the large proportion, 8.9%, who are employed in the sector compared with only 4.5% in Montreal. Otherwise, the sectoral patterns of employment repeat those discussed previously.

Despite the growing importance of self-employment in the Canadian economy (Statistics Canada 1998), the vast majority of immigrant workers in Toronto and Montreal are employees (Table 3). In Toronto, the proportion of immigrant women who are self-employed is almost identical to the proportion for Canadian-born women, 8.3%, while a slightly higher proportion of immigrant men than Canadian-born men are self-employed, 16.6% versus 14.2%. Differences between immigrants and Canadian-born are more apparent in Montreal but the differences are small, ranging between 3.5% for immigrant and Canadian-born men and 2.1% for Canadian-born and immigrant women. Certainly, in 1996, there is little evidence that, in aggregate, immigrants are more likely than the Canadian-born to be self-employed.⁷

7. The aggregate information may mask substantial differences in the propensity for self-employment among immigrants from different birthplaces and ethnic groups (Reitz 1998).

Hours of work are also very similar in Toronto and Montreal. Trends in both metropolitan areas where the majority of people work full-time, at least 30 hours per week, mirror national trends (Statistics Canada 1998). Women are more likely than men to work fewer hours. More than 26% of immigrant women in Toronto and slightly fewer in Montreal, 20.9%, work part-time compared with 16.5% and 11.9% of immigrant men (Table 3). Part-time work is slightly more common among Canadian-born women than among immigrant women, approximately 26% of Canadian-born women work part-time versus approximately 20% of immigrant women. Economic necessity may well account for the slightly lower rate of participation of immigrant women in part-time work.

Analysis of mean annual wages and earnings confirms that immigrant women may have economic incentives to work full-time. The mean annual wages and earnings of immigrant workers in 1990 are significantly ($p < 0.01$) lower than those of Canadian-born workers in both metropolitan areas (Table 3). Analysis of variance also revealed a significant ($p < 0.01$) gender effect such that women earn less than men, regardless of whether they are Canadian-born or immigrants. Immigrants also have greater variation in their mean annual wages and earnings. The coefficients of variation for immigrant men and women in both metropolitan areas are higher than for Canadian-born workers. The diverse human capital of the immigrant population in each metropolitan area undoubtedly contributes to variation in their earnings. Compared with Toronto, variation in earnings is larger in Montreal where immigrant workers are also more diverse in terms of their educational attainments and knowledge of French, the official language of daily life.

Trends in the Gender and Birthplace Division of Employment

The current employment patterns of immigrants in Montreal and Toronto reflect recent deindustrialisation in both metropolitan areas. Among the four groups of workers, immigrant women have been affected most by the loss of manufacturing jobs. Between 1981 and 1991, the manufacturing share of immigrant women's total employment fell by 7.3% and 7.1% in Montreal and Toronto, respectively (Table 4). The rate of decline diminished thereafter, with a loss of only 2.4% in Montreal and 0.8% in Toronto between 1991 and 1996. The proportional loss was larger for immigrant women than for any other group of workers. Immigrant

TABLE 4 Percentage Change in Distribution of Employment by Industry, Class of Worker, and Hours of Work in the Montreal and Toronto CMAs, 1981 to 1996

	Immigrant				Canadian Born			
	Female		Male		Female		Male	
	81-91	91-96	81-91	91-96	81-91	91-96	81-91	91-96
MONTREAL								
Industry								
Primary	0.0	0.3	0.2	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1
Manufacturing	-7.3	-2.4	-4.3	0.5	-4.7	-1.2	-5.7	0.1
Construction	0.2	-0.2	0.1	-2.4	0.8	-0.6	2.6	-1.7
Trans/Comm/Util.	-0.2	-0.4	-1.7	0.2	-0.9	-0.1	-1.0	-1.1

Wholesale Trade	0.1	1.3	0.8	0.7	-0.7	0.6	-0.3	1.4
Retail Trade	0.2	-1.9	2.1	0.0	0.4	0.2	0.5	0.0
FIRE	-0.9	0.1	0.1	-0.3	0.3	-1.1	0.5	-0.7
Business Svcs.	1.0	1.0	2.2	1.1	2.1	0.6	2.5	0.7
Government	0.4	0.1	0.4	0.0	0.8	-0.5	-0.7	-1.1
Education	-0.1	0.0	0.0	0.3	-0.3	0.2	-0.6	0.4
Hlth & Social Svcs.	2.3	1.6	0.1	-0.4	0.2	0.5	-0.2	0.4
Accom./Food/Bev.	1.0	-0.2	0.7	-1.0	-0.2	0.4	0.5	0.5
Other Services	3.3	1.1	1.0	1.1	1.8	0.8	1.6	1.1

Class of Worker

Employed	-2.7	-1.1	-2.0	-1.0	-2.2	-1.3	-2.7	-2.3
Self-employed	2.7	1.1	2.0	1.0	2.2	1.3	2.7	2.3

Hours of Work per Week

Full-time	12.3	-1.7	6.7	-2.8	13.1	-3.2	8.6	-1.8
Part-time	-12.3	1.7	-6.7	2.8	-13.1	3.2	-8.6	1.8

TORONTO**Industry**

Primary	0.0	-0.2	0.3	-0.4	0.2	-0.2	0.0	-0.3
Manufacturing	-7.1	-0.8	-6.9	0.3	-4.5	-1.8	-6.8	-1.2
Construction	0.1	-0.5	-0.4	-2.6	0.7	0.5	2.9	-2.1
Trans/Comm/Util.	-0.1	0.1	0.3	-0.1	-0.2	-0.7	-1.3	0.1
Wholesale Trade	-0.3	0.6	-0.8	1.2	-1.6	1.1	-1.8	2.3
Retail Trade	0.5	-1.6	1.8	-0.8	-0.1	-1.1	1.0	-0.2
FIRE	0.0	-0.7	1.3	-0.1	-0.5	-0.5	0.9	0.0
Business Svcs.	3.1	0.8	2.5	1.5	2.3	0.9	2.9	0.9
Government	0.1	-1.1	0.1	-1.5	0.4	-1.6	0.4	-1.6
Education	0.4	0.3	-0.2	0.1	1.7	0.3	0.5	-0.1
Hlth & Social Svcs.	1.7	1.9	0.2	0.3	2.0	1.8	-0.1	0.4
Accom./Food/Bev.	0.1	0.3	0.7	1.2	-1.1	0.5	0.2	0.5
Other Services	1.7	0.9	1.1	0.8	0.7	1.8	1.4	1.4

Class of Worker

Employed	-1.6	-2.3	-1.1	-3.4	-2.7	-3.0	-2.3	-3.1
Self-employed	1.6	2.3	1.1	3.4	2.7	3.0	2.3	3.1

Hours of Work per Week

Full-time	9.0	-3.5	5.3	-2.1	2.4	-2.9	1.8	-2.1
Part-time	-9.0	3.5	-5.3	2.1	-2.4	2.9	-1.8	2.1

Source: Computed by authors.

women's employment has also been affected by macroeconomic conditions. The recession in the early 1990s contributed to the declining share of immigrant women's employment in retailing in both metropolitan areas (Table 4). In Toronto, provincial and federal government austerity is evident in the declining share of immigrant women's employment in government administration. For immigrant women in Montreal, employment in this sector increased slightly during the same period.

Immigrant women have found alternative employment in different industries

in the two metropolitan areas. In Toronto, immigrant women found work in the expanding business services sector where the share of immigrant women's employment increased by 3.1% between 1981 and 1990 and a much smaller 0.8% in the next five years (Table 4). Immigrant women's employment also grew in health and social services and in other personal services. In Montreal, where business services are a much smaller part of the metropolitan economy, immigrant women substituted jobs in health and social services, other personal services, and the accommodation, food and beverage services for manufacturing jobs (Table 4). The shift in immigrant women's employment from manufacturing to consumer services may foreshadow declining economic prospects. Compared with jobs in business, health and social services, jobs in consumer services such as the accommodation, food and beverage services are often poorly paid and insecure (Statistics Canada 1995)

Deindustrialisation also forced immigrant men out of manufacturing jobs, but the losses are smaller than those experienced by immigrant women and they occurred only during the 1980s. While the share of immigrant women employed in manufacturing fell between 7.1% and 7.3%, the shares for immigrant men fell only 6.9% in Toronto and 4.3% in Montreal (Table 4). Moreover, for immigrant men in both metropolitan areas, the decline was arrested after 1990. Between 1991 and 1996, the shares of immigrant men's employment in manufacturing increased slightly in Toronto and Montreal.

The recession of the early 1990s likely contributed to immigrant men's declining employment in construction between 1991 and 1996 (Table 4). The recession may also account for the decline in immigrant men's employment in Montreal's accommodation, food and beverage services, a cyclical industry that contracts during recessions when incomes and employment decline. In Toronto, immigrant men, like their female counterparts, lost jobs in government administration.

In both metropolitan areas, immigrant men found a growing share of jobs in business services with increases that ranged between 2.2% and 2.5% between 1981 and 1990 followed by equally strong increases of 1.1% and 1.5% between 1991 and 1996 (Table 4). Wholesale trade was a second source of jobs for immigrant men in Montreal and Toronto between 1991 and 1996. Immigrants' involvement in import/export businesses has probably contributed to the growth of employment in wholesale trade; however, one must be cautious estimating immigrant participation in import/export businesses. A recent survey of Chinese immigrants in Toronto indicated the majority were employed in other industries -- specifically, catering, real estate, retail trade and the natural sciences (Ma 1997). Import/export businesses ranked fifth among the industries in which Chinese immigrants were employed.

Birthplace and Employment

To elucidate the various effects of gender and place of birth, the industries of

employment for five groups of immigrants were examined in detail. They include immigrants from the United Kingdom, the largest single group of immigrants in the Toronto metropolitan area who are also most assimilated in the Toronto and Canadian labour markets (Boyd 1992; Preston and Giles 1997; Reitz 1998). Italian immigrants were also analysed separately because this is the largest group of immigrants in Montreal with an even larger contingent in Toronto. Previous analysis has shown that Italian immigrants have labour market experiences similar to those of many southern and eastern European immigrants who arrived from Portugal, Greece, the former Yugoslavia and other Balkan countries prior to 1980 (Preston and Giles 1997). Among the most recent immigrants, our analysis is confined to large groups for whom economic information can be disaggregated and who can be identified consistently from census information, i.e. immigrants from Asia, Africa and Central and South America.⁸ These immigrants are also disproportionately members of visible minorities, the social group that has emerged from national studies as the most disadvantaged in terms of unemployment rates and employment incomes (Reitz 1998; Statistics Canada 1998; Lian and Matthews 1998).

Country of birth has a significant influence upon employment patterns. In 1996, the proportions of immigrant workers who work part-time and who are employees rather than self-employed varies by country of birth (Table 5). The variations among birthplace groups are as large as those between immigrant and Canadian-born workers. For example, in Montreal, approximately 90% of immigrant men and women born in the United Kingdom are employees. The gender parity is unusual, since the proportions of immigrant men from Italy, Asia, Africa, and Central and South America who are employees are lower than those for their female counterparts from each birthplace. Among male immigrants, the proportions of workers who are employees are also lower for immigrants born in Italy, Africa, and Central and South America than for those born in the United Kingdom. The proportions of immigrant women and men from each country of birth who are employees range as widely in Toronto as in Montreal.

Hours of work are equally variable. In the Toronto metropolitan area, approximately one-fifth of immigrant women from each country work part-time, however, the equivalent proportions for male immigrants range from 5.5% for

TABLE 5 Shares of Workers from Selected Countries or Regions of Birth Who Are Employees and Who Work Part-time, Montreal and Toronto CMAs, 1996 (per cent)

	UK		Italy		Asia		Africa		C/S America	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
MONTREAL										
Part-time	34.7	10.3	15.2	4.5	19.5	11.8	21.6	15.5	23.2	13.7
Employee	90.2	90.3	94.1	80.4	90.1	83.4	92.8	82.7	94.5	92.8
TORONTO										

8. The information about country of birth in the Public Use Microdata Files is extremely limited in 1981. As a result, large and somewhat heterogeneous groups must be identified.

Part-time	21.7	9.2	21.5	5.5	19.8	11.0	22.0	12.1	18.0	11.0
Employee	90.8	82.4	90.9	76.6	91.6	84.3	91.6	82.6	95.9	90.1

Source: Computed by authors

men born in Italy to a high of 12.1% for African immigrant men (Table 5). In Montreal, the direction of gender differences is similar, but the magnitude of gender differences is larger than in Toronto. Among immigrants from the United Kingdom, 10.3% of men worked part-time, less than a third of the 34.7% of women who worked part-time. The prevalence of part-time work for immigrant men in Montreal ranges from 15.5% for African men to 4.5% for Italian men. Among immigrant women, the range is even larger, from a maximum of 34.7% to a minimum of 15.2%.

Examination of the proportions of workers from each country of birth who are employed in each industrial sector confirms that immigrants from Asia, Africa, and Central and South America, the main sources of recent immigrants, are less successful in the labour market than earlier waves of post-war immigrants represented by Italian and British immigrants. Italian immigrants have gained access to well paid jobs in the goods-producing sectors, while male immigrants from the United Kingdom are concentrated in the dynamic service sectors, producer and social services. Location quotients confirm that manufacturing continues to be a crucial source of employment for immigrant men from all birthplaces (Table 6). In both metropolitan areas, each location quotient that compares the percentage of male immigrants from each birthplace who are employed in manufacturing with the equivalent percentage for Canadian-born men exceeds 1.0. Italian immigrants are the most concentrated in the goods-producing sectors; manufacturing, construction, and primary processing. In Montreal, the proportions of immigrant men from the United Kingdom and Italy employed in manufacturing are similar, approximately 30%; however, 0.6% of British immigrants work in construction where 15.1% of Italian immigrant men are so employed. The same patterns are found in Toronto where approximately 21% of British and Italian men work in manufacturing, but again, a higher proportion of Italian men than their British counterparts work in construction. Twenty-seven percent of Italian immigrant men in Toronto have construction jobs compared with only 6.3% of immigrant men from the United Kingdom.

Immigrant men from Asia and Central and South America are also concentrated in manufacturing jobs with location quotients that exceed those for men

TABLE 6 Location Quotients^a for Female and Male Workers, by Sector and Place of Birth, in Montreal and Toronto CMAs, 1996

Sector	UK		Italy		Asia		Africa		C/S America	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
MONTREAL										
Manu./Primary	1.5	1.4	3.7	1.4	2.8	1.5	1.5	1.1	2.2	1.7
Construction	0.7	0.1	1.0	2.0	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.4	0.4
Distributive	1.0	0.7	0.7	0.8	0.8	0.8	1.1	0.8	0.6	0.8

Producer	0.9	1.9	0.6	0.5	0.5	0.8	1.1	1.4	0.5	0.6
Social	1.3	1.2	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.6	0.9	1.2	1.2	0.9
Consumer	0.6	0.5	0.7	1.0	1.0	1.3	0.9	1.0	0.8	1.0
TORONTO										
Manu./Primary	1.1	1.2	2.5	1.2	2.1	1.6	1.2	1.2	1.4	1.6
Construction	0.6	0.9	3.3	3.8	0.4	0.4	0.4	0.5	0.6	0.8
Distributive	0.8	0.8	0.7	0.7	0.9	0.7	0.6	0.8	0.9	0.9
Producer	1.0	1.2	0.7	0.4	0.9	0.9	1.2	1.0	0.9	0.8
Social	1.0	1.0	0.7	0.7	0.7	0.7	1.1	1.0	1.0	0.7
Consumer	0.8	0.6	1.0	0.9	1.0	1.2	0.9	1.1	0.9	1.0

Note: 1. Location quotients showing sectoral distribution of foreign born workers, by place of birth and gender, relative to the distribution for all Canadian workers.

Source: Computed by authors

from Italy and the United Kingdom, but overall, goods-producing industries are less important sources of employment for these two groups of immigrants. The construction industry is the source of a much smaller proportion of their total employment in both metropolitan areas. In Toronto, the location quotients for Asian and Central and South American immigrant men in construction are 0.4 and 0.8, respectively. Construction is more important to these immigrant groups in Montreal but it still employs small proportions of workers: 2.9% of Asian immigrant men and 6.1% of Central and South American immigrant men work in construction.

The employment patterns of African men differ from those of Asian and Central and South American immigrant men. Much smaller percentages of African men work in manufacturing, where the location quotients are 1.09 in Montreal and 1.25 in Toronto. African men are also under-represented in construction with location quotients of .22 and .49, respectively.

Immigrant men's employment in service industries is equally disparate. Location quotients reveal that Italian immigrant men are under-represented in service jobs (Table 6). For each of the four service sectors, the location quotient for Italian immigrant men is less than 1.0. For immigrant men from the United Kingdom, the shares of employment in producer and social services slightly exceed those of Canadian-born men. Moreover, they are under-represented in poorly-paid consumer service jobs. In contrast, African immigrant men have shares of employment in producer, social, and consumer services similar to the shares for Canadian-born men. The location quotients indicate that after Italian immigrant men, immigrant men from Central and South America are most under-represented in producer services, the economic sectors where growth is expected (Economic Council of Canada 1991).

The patterns of concentration for immigrant women from the five birthplace groups mirror several aspects of those for immigrant men (Table 6). Manufacturing is an even more important sector of employment for immigrant women than for immigrant men. For each birthplace group, the location quotient calculated for manufacturing is higher for women than for men. Italian immigrant women like

their male counterparts are distinguished by a concentration of employment in the construction industry, a sector in which immigrant women from Asia, Africa, and Central and South America are under-represented. Employment in service industries is varied. Immigrant women from the United Kingdom stand out with a high level of employment in social services. Italian immigrant women are under-represented in every service industry. Among Asian, African, and Central and South American immigrant women, the significance of employment in service industries varies. While under-represented in producer and social services, the share of Asian immigrant women working in consumer services is approximately the same as that of Canadian-born women. For African women, employment in distributive and producer services is proportional to that of Canadian-born women, but African women are under-represented in social and consumer services. Central and South American immigrant women are reasonably represented in social services but under-represented in all other service industries.

In sum, the location quotients for both metropolitan areas reveal a continuing reliance on manufacturing employment by all immigrants. Compared with Canadian-born workers, immigrant men and women from the five sources are concentrated in manufacturing. Location quotients for manufacturing that ranged from 1.5 to 3.7 underscore the economic vulnerability of immigrant women. Even though immigrant women from the United Kingdom were least concentrated in manufacturing jobs, when compared with Canadian-born women, they were still reliant on the manufacturing sector with a location quotient of 1.5. Immigrant women are still part of a secondary labour market which Canadian-born workers are abandoning. The only sign of improvement is that women born in regions that are sources of recent immigrants are less concentrated in manufacturing than earlier arrivals. For the manufacturing sector, the location quotients for immigrant women from Asia, Africa, and Central and South American are lower than those for Italian women. New arrivals are less dependent than earlier immigrant women on employment in the manufacturing sector.

The location quotients also indicate that construction jobs are not a common means of entering the labour market, even for immigrant men in Toronto. The preponderance of Italian immigrant men in the construction industries of Toronto and Montreal is an historical artifact that reflects the arrival of rural migrants in both metropolitan areas at a time when semi-skilled and skilled construction jobs were readily available. As the Italian population grew, Italian workers established an ethnic enclave dominated by themselves and other immigrants arriving at the same time, i.e. Portuguese, Greeks and Yugoslavians. Recent immigrants from Africa, Asia, and Central and Southern America are under-represented in the construction sectors of the two metropolitan areas for several reasons. Recent immigrants may lack skills required for construction jobs, they may be qualified for other professions, and they may be unable to penetrate the ethnically-dominated sector. Provincial regulations governing the construction industry may also inhibit their employment in Montreal.

The findings confirm that urban labour markets continue to be stratified along the lines of nationality and gender with immigrants most like Anglo-Canadians in

the ascendancy. The location quotients highlight the economic success of immigrant men from the United Kingdom, the only immigrant group that has a marked concentration in producer services. Previous studies have reported that immigrant men from the United Kingdom are on average the most successful immigrants economically (Mata 1996; Reitz 1998). Italian immigrants formed part of a second tier of moderately successful immigrants concentrated in goods-producing industries, while immigrants from Central and South America were among those least successful in the Toronto labour market. In 1991, Mata (1996) reported that the employment patterns of Asian and African immigrants were so diverse they did not fit easily into this hierarchy. Our empirical analysis suggests the same conclusion for 1996. The employment patterns of African and Asian immigrants are still too complex for easy categorisation. As in 1991, immigrant men and women from Africa have more success in the Toronto and Montreal labour markets than their counterparts from Central and South America and Asia. In both labour markets, African immigrant men are better represented in producer and social services than Asian and Central and South American men. African women are also more likely to be employed in producer services than those from Asia and Central and South America.

The current patterns of stratification are the result of complex changes in employment shares. Analysis of the absolute change in the employment share for each sector between 1981 and 1991 and then, between 1991 and 1996 revealed the profound impact of deindustrialisation. Between 1981 and 1991, the share of employment in manufacturing and processing industries fell for all but two immigrant groups. In Montreal, African immigrant men and immigrant women from the United Kingdom recorded the only increases in the share of employment in manufacturing and processing. In Toronto, employment in manufacturing declined for every immigrant group. Italian immigrant women experienced the largest decline, their share of employment in manufacturing fell by 19.3%. In comparison, Asian women experienced the smallest decrease, only 4.2%. In general, the magnitude of the losses were smaller in Montreal, ranging from 16.5% for Italian immigrant women to 1.2% for immigrant men from the United Kingdom and immigrant women from Africa.

Apart from the loss of manufacturing jobs, there were few consistent trends in the distributions of employment among sectors either within a single metropolitan area or between the two metropolitan areas. For example, in Montreal, British women's employment in producer services fell 9.7% between 1981 and 1991 while Italian women's share of employment in the sector grew by 5.3%. For immigrant men, employment change in the sector ranged from an increase of 2.1% for men from the United Kingdom to a loss of 0.3% for African men. The changes in shares indicate that loss of manufacturing employment has occurred consistently in both metropolitan areas across all nationality and gender groups. However, the sectors where immigrant men and women are finding replacement jobs are less clear. Country of origin and gender both influence employment in service industries in complicated ways.

The trends in employment shares between 1991 and 1996 confirm the

complex nature of the shift to service employment. While deindustrialisation is still associated with declining employment in manufacturing, its effects are neither as large or as consistent in the first five years of the 1990s. The largest decline in manufacturing employment occurs in Montreal where the share for immigrant women from Central and South America fell by 6.5%. In Toronto, the losses are smaller, ranging from 2.2% to 0.1%. It appears that the rate of deindustrialisation has slowed. At the same time, the growth of Asian immigrant populations in both metropolitan areas is associated with a slight increase in employment in manufacturing for Asian men and women. The increase is smaller in Toronto, 0.8% for women and 1.3% for men, than in Montreal where it is 3% for women and 4% for men, but the consistency is notable.

Trends in service employment are still difficult to discern. Gender differences seem to dominate in some industries. For example, in producer services, employment for immigrant men has increased at the same time that it has declined or been static for most immigrant women. The pattern for social services in Toronto that include health, education, and government, is reversed, with women's share of employment increasing while that of men declined. Provincial government austerity may well have created this consistent pattern since changes in Montreal are much more diverse. For three nationalities, the United Kingdom, Italy, and Central and South America, men and women had increasing shares of employment in social services. African men reported increases while African women along with Asian men and women saw their shares of employment in services decline. In contrast, the changes in employment in consumer services differ according to country of origin. Shares declined for men and women from most countries of origin. In Toronto, increased shares were recorded by Italian men and Central and South American women, while in Montreal, Asian men had an increased share of employment in consumer services.

The changing sectoral distribution of employment for men and women from each country of origin suggests that the stratification of the labour market may be changing slowly. However, as yet, it is difficult to discern more than the overwhelming effects of deindustrialisation. The loss of manufacturing jobs is heightened by the timing of the census which occurred during the depths of the recession in Toronto and in Montreal. Our comparison of employment patterns at three points in time provides snapshots of the labour force participation of immigrant workers, but it does not reveal individual processes of change.

Conclusions

The empirical findings have demonstrated the marginal employment experiences of many immigrants in Canada's two largest metropolitan areas. Their jobs are concentrated in manufacturing, a sector where total employment has been declining, at the same time that immigrants are under-represented in producer services, the economic sector where employment growth is expected. The

concentration of immigrant workers in declining economic sectors has persisted since 1981 in Toronto, suggesting that it is a persistent trend during the recent period of economic restructuring (Mata 1996; Preston and Giles 1997). Given the stratification of employment, it is not surprising that immigrant men and immigrant women still earn less on average than their Canadian-born counterparts in both metropolitan areas.

Gender differences add to the complex effects of birthplace. Canadian-born and immigrant women are more likely than their male counterparts in both metropolitan areas to work part-time and to work as employees. Immigrant women also suffer the disadvantage of their employment being concentrated in manufacturing jobs. Their marginal position in the labour market is highlighted by the fact that immigrant women in both metropolitan areas reported annual earnings significantly lower than those of any other group of worker.

As reported previously, immigrants' employment patterns vary between the two metropolitan areas (Hiebert 1997; Pendakur and Pendakur 1998). There are subtle but marked differences in the sectoral distributions of immigrant and Canadian-born workers between Montreal and Toronto. Some differences reflect the two regulatory regimes that prevail in Montreal and Toronto, while others reflect divergent economic bases. Provincial regulation has affected recent immigrants' participation in the construction industry. At the same time, the slower growth of producer services in Montreal than in Toronto has created fewer alternatives for Canadian-born workers outside the manufacturing sector.

Analysts must take account of intermetropolitan variations in economic circumstances as well as the effects of gender and country of origin to understand immigrants' experiences in Canadian labour markets. Policy responses intended to ameliorate the economic position of immigrants will have to be tailored to local circumstances. To develop appropriate policy, additional research is required to identify the reasons for immigrants' diverse employment patterns in Toronto and Montreal.

Policy will also have to take account of the variations among immigrant workers. Metropolitan labour markets are stratified on the basis of nationality and birthplace. The employment patterns of immigrants from various birthplaces differ. The findings parallel those reported earlier at national and metropolitan levels (Boyd 1991; Mata 1996; Preston and Giles 1997; Reitz 1998). Three employment patterns are evident in both metropolitan areas. Immigrant men from the United Kingdom have employment patterns most similar to those of Canadian-born men. With large proportions of jobs in construction and manufacturing, Italian immigrants are distinguished from the Canadian-born and recent immigrant groups represented by Central and South American, African, and Asian immigrants. Employed in different industries than earlier waves of post-war immigrants such as the Italians and British, immigrants from Asia, Africa, and Central and South America have diverse employment patterns. While Central and South American immigrants seem to face the most obstacles, additional research is needed to determine the implications of persistent stratification. While it seems reasonable to assert that employment in the accommodation, beverage and foods sector is less

desirable than employment in health and producer services, the wide range of occupations in service industries and their diverse working conditions mean the effects of the shift to employment in services must be explored in future research.

To sum up then, the empirical analysis has revealed remarkably persistent stratification of immigrants within Canada's two largest metropolitan labour forces. Despite immigration policies intended to select migrants who will succeed rapidly in the Canadian economy, immigrants' sectors of employment still vary along the lines of birthplace. Our analysis has not allowed us to take explicit account of years of residence in Canada, so we cannot say whether longer residence will ameliorate the employment of immigrants from Asia, Africa, and Central and South America. The continuing admission of large numbers of immigrants from these origins underscores the urgency of additional research to examine the reasons for persistent marginalisation of immigrants. As Reitz (1998) has noted this is among the most important public policy questions facing Canadian society.

References

- Badets, J. and D. Howatson-Lee. 1999. "Recent Immigrants in the Workforce". *Canadian Social Trends*, Spring: 16-22.
- Bakan, A. and D. Stasiulus. 1997. *Not One of the Family: Foreign Domestic Workers in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Bailey, T. and R. Waldinger. 1991. "The Changing Ethnic/ Racial Division of Labor", in J.H. Mollenkopf and M. Castells (eds.). *Dual City, Restructuring New York*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Borjas, G. 1993. "Immigration Policy, National Origin, and Immigrant Skills: A Comparison of Canada and the United States", in D. Card and R. B. Freeman (eds.). *Small Differences that Matter: Labor Markets and Income Maintenance in Canada and the United States*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Boyd, M. 1992. "Adding Gender: Immigration Trends and Language Fluency Issues in Canada and the United States", in B. R. Chiswick (ed.). *Immigration, Language and Ethnicity: Canada and the United States*. Washington, D.C.: American Enterprise Institute.
- Chiswick, B.R. 1992. "Language in the Immigrant Labour Market", in B. R. Chiswick (ed.). *Immigration, Language, and Ethnicity*. Washington, DC: American Enterprise Institute.
- Chorney, H. 1992. "Globalization, Monetarism, the Local Economy, and the Search for Full Employment", in T.L. Thomaas (ed.). *The Politics of the City: A Canadian Perspective*. Toronto: ITP Nelson.
- Chui, T. and M.S. Devereaux. 1995. "Canada's Newest Workers". *Perspectives on Labor and Income*, Spring: 17-23.
- Coffey, W. 1994. *The Evolution of Canada's Metropolitan Economies*. Montreal:

- Institute for Research on Public Policy.
- Coffey, W. and M. Polèse. 1993. "Le déclin de l'empire montréalais: regards sur l'économie d'un métropole en mutation". *Recherches Sociographiques*, 34.
- DeVoretz, D.J. 1995. *Diminishing Returns: the Economics of Canada's Recent Immigration Policy*. Toronto: C.D. Howe Institute.
- Economic Council of Canada. 1991. *Good Jobs, Bad Jobs: Employment in the Service Economy*. Ottawa: Economic Council of Canada.
- Hiebert, D. 1997. *The Colour of Work: Labour Market Segmentation in Montréal, Toronto, and Vancouver, 1991*. RIIM Working Paper Series 97. Vancouver: RIIM.
- Iacovetta, F. 1992. *Such Hardworking People: Italian Immigrants in Postwar Toronto*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Lian, J.Z. and D.R. Matthews. 1998. "Does the Vertical Mosaic Still Exist? Ethnicity and Income in Canada, 1991". *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, 35: 461-481.
- Liu, X.F. 1996. "A Case Study of the Labour Market Status of Recent Mainland Chinese Immigrants, Metropolitan Toronto". *International Migration*, 34: 583-605.
- Ma, A. 1997. *The Economic Strategies of Chinese Canadians*. Toronto: Advance Business Club and Ambrose Ma.
- Mata, F. 1996. "Birthplace and Economic Similarities in the Labour Force: An Analysis of Toronto's Census Microdata", in A. Lapierre, V. Lindstrom, and T.P. Seiler (eds.). *Immigration and Ethnicity in Canada*. Montreal: Association for Ethnic Studies.
- Morissette, R., J. Myles and G. Picot. 1995. "Earnings Polarization in Canada: 1969-1991", in K.F. Banting and C. M. Beach (eds.). *Labour Market Polarization and Social Policy Reform*. Kingston: School of Policy Studies, Queen's University.
- Ornstein, M. 1996. *Ethno-racial Inequality in Metropolitan Toronto: Analysis of the 1991 Census*. Toronto: Access and Equity Centre, Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto.
- Peck, J. 1996. *Workplace: The Social Regulation of Labor Markets*. New York: Guilford.
- Pendakur, K. and R. Pendakur. 1998. *Speaking in Tongues: Language Knowledge as Human Capital and Ethnicity*. Ottawa: Multiculturalism Canada, Canadian Heritage.
- Pendakur, K. and F. Mata. 1998. *Tracking Industrial Location Propensities of 60s Immigrants in Canada: An Analysis of Metropolitan Census Microdata*. Ottawa: Multiculturalism Canada, Canadian Heritage.
- Preston, V. and W. Giles. 1997. "Ethnicity, Gender, and Labour Markets in Canada: A Case Study of Immigrant Women in Toronto". *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 6: 135-159.
- Preston, V. and G. Man. 1999. "Employment Experience of Chinese Immigrant Women: An Exploration of Diversity". *Canadian Women's Studies/ Les cahiers des femmes*, forthcoming.

- Ray, B. 1997. "The Measurement and Meaning of Segregation in Montreal", in M. McAndrew and N. Lapierre Vincent (eds.). *Metropolis Year II, Proceedings of the Second National Conference*. Montreal: Immigration and Metropolis Inter-University Research Centre of Montreal on Immigration, Integration, and the Urban Dynamics.
- Reitz, J. 1998. *Warmth of the Welcome, The Social Causes of Economic Success for Immigrants in Different Nations and Cities*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- St. Germain, A. 1997. *Case Studies of Research and Policy on Migrants in Cities -- Montreal*. Background paper prepared for the Second International Metropolis Conference, Copenhagen, September.
- Stanback, T.M. and T. Noyelle. 1984. *The Economic Transformation of American Cities*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Statistics Canada. 1989. *The 1986 Census of Canada, Public Use Microdata File, User Documentation*. Ottawa.
- _____. 1993. *The 1991 Census of Canada, Public Use Sample Tapes File, User Documentation*. Ottawa.
- _____. 1995. *Women in Canada, A Statistical Report, Third Edition*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.
- _____. 1997. "1996 Census: Immigration and Citizenship". *The Daily*, November 4.
- _____. 1998. "1996 Census: Labour Force Activity, Occupation and Industry, Place of Work, Mode of Transportation to Work, Unpaid Work". *The Daily*, March 17.
- _____. 1999. *The 1996 Census of Canada, Public Use Microdata File, User Documentation*. Ottawa.
- Teixeira, C. 1996. "Suburbanization of Portuguese Communities in Toronto and Montreal: From Isolation to Residential Integration?". *Canadian Issues*, 18: 181-205.
- Waldinger, R. 1996. "Immigrant Integration in the Postindustrial Metropolis: A View from the United States". Paper prepared for the Working Group Session on Urban Economic Restructuring: Implications for Immigrants and Other Marginalized Groups, First Annual Conference, Metropolis Project, Milan, Italy, November.